



**CCDA**

California Commission  
on Disability Access

DRA

Summary Report

### **APPOINTED MEMBERS**

Guy Leemhuis, Chairperson  
Doug Wiele, Vice Chairperson  
Christopher Downey  
Brian Holloway  
Walter Hughes  
Scott Lillibridge  
Celia McGuinness  
Michael Paravagna  
Tiffany A. Potter  
Betty Wilson  
Laurie Cohen Yoo

### **LEGISLATIVE MEMBERS**

Assemblymember Jim Frazier  
Assemblymember Tom Lackey

### **EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS**

Attorney General Xavier Becerra  
by Anthony Sefarian  
Chester "Chet" Widom, State  
Architect

### **EXECUTIVE STAFF**

Angela Jemmott

**LISTENING FORUM**  
California Disability Parking  
Programs

**1:00 – 4:00 PM**  
**Sierra 2 Center**  
**Sacramento, CA**  
**March 13, 2018**

## Introduction

On March 13, 2018, the California Commission on Disability Access (CCDA) held its second California Disability Parking Programs Listening Forum. The Forum was held at Sierra 2 Center in Sacramento, CA. The objectives of the Listening Forum were to:

- Share progress by the California Department of Motor Vehicles on addressing audit recommendations.
- Gather feedback from diverse stakeholders on program improvements, models from other states, and proposed legislation.
- Compile and develop recommendations from the forum to submit to the California State Legislature.

The Listening Forum featured a panel representing the California Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV), City of Sacramento Parking Services, and the California Foundation for Independent Living Centers. The panel was followed by small group discussions on topics associated with California Disability Parking Programs. The full Listening Forum Agenda can be found at the end of this report in Appendix 1.

This summary report includes recommendations for the Disability Parking Program provided by Forum participants. A full transcript of the Forum including panel presentations can be found on the CCDA website at: <https://ccda.ca.gov/listening-forums/>. The Listening Forum was followed by a Legislative Coffee Chat featuring three representatives from the California State legislature, Assembly Member Jim Frazier, Assembly Member Tom Lackey, and Deputy District Director Joe Debbs, representing Senator Richard Pan. The transcript of the Legislative Chat can be found on the CCDA website here: <https://ccda.ca.gov/listening-forums/>.

## Small Group Conversation Topics

Attendees were invited to participate in small group conversations on three topics related to Disability Parking Access. The conversation topics were:

1. Disability Parking Access - (Discussion items: availability of accessible parking spaces, blue zones, meters, regional or local parking initiatives)

*Based on what you heard today and your experience with the disability parking program, what's working and what recommendations do you have for improving parking access?*

2. DMV Placard Program Management - (Discussion items: DMV progress on addressing audit recommendations; public awareness campaign; general program management)

*Based on what you heard today and your experience with the DMV placard program, what's working and what recommendations do you have for DMV improving its Program Management?*

3. Program Innovations - *what recommendations do you for program innovations? What are best practices from other cities or states that you're aware of?*

## **Participant Recommendations**

Over 50 individuals participated in the small group conversations including a “virtual” small group which discussed the topics via teleconference. A list of organizations represented at the Listening Forum can be found in Appendix II. Observations and recommendations cut across all three small conversation topics. The recommendations have been grouped into three themes below.

### **1. Program Education**

Participants expressed a desire for increased and targeted communication for program participants, the public, and business on a variety of topics associated with disability parking access. Specific recommendations include:

- Create a public awareness campaign about the program including images of individuals with disabilities
- Ensure awareness campaigns are accessible to the visually and hearing impaired
- Create a “Shame” Campaign to reduce program abuse
- Direct public education to the provider community
- Increase awareness related to:
  - Placard holder authorization to park in two spaces if no accessible space is available
  - Sizes of accessible parking spaces (van vs. non-van)
- To increase understanding of program rules and requirements and to reduce program abuse the placard envelope from the DMV should be accompanied by program educational materials
- Provide placard program education to agencies who hire caregivers for individuals with disabilities (e.g., In-home Supportive Services agencies)

### **2. Program Changes**

Recommendations for Disability Parking Program changes ranged from increasing parking availability to improving the application process and tightening program eligibility.

#### *2A. Improvements to Parking Access*

- Increase disabled street parking
- Allow accessible parking in yellow zones
- Allow placard users who can't find a metered space to park in a garage

- Keep up with the demands of the growing elderly / disabled population
- Improve State agency compliance with disabled parking access laws by increasing the number of available spaces in State parking facilities
- Provide attendants to assist with parking (e.g., giving directions; assisting with ticket machines)
- Integrate self-driving vehicles into placard usage and policies
- Create accessible vehicle options for ridesharing (i.e., Lyft and Uber – Uber Assist Training)
- Provide roof clearance for vans in parking garages
- Provide dedicated accessible van spaces
- Put van spaces farther away from entrances
- Provide wheelchair accessible curbs and sidewalks near on-street parking
- Conduct more field research and practical trials.
- Establish a mobility-based two-tiered metering system
- Disallow metered parking without adhering to the rates and time limits of the meters
- Encourage the implementation of best practices including reduced rates for airport long-term parking and disabled access for loading and unloading of passengers
- Increase the number of ADA recommended number of disabled parking spaces especially at locations with high need (e.g., hospitals, medical offices and assisted living facilities)

#### *2B. Program Eligibility Improvements*

- Ask additional questions on application to minimize abuse
- Redefine what it means to have a disability or need a placard
- Placard issuance should be based on need, not convenience
- Review Social Security Number during application process to prevent renewals for placards registered to people who are deceased
- Increase renewal frequency to help decrease fraud

#### *2C. Program Enhancements Related to Providers*

- Require providers to be certified to sell placards
- Establish a DMV code for issuing doctor to link to placard number
- Create a mechanism to survey doctors or healthcare practitioners

#### *2D. Enhancements to Placards*

- Create placards that say “placard holder assistant”
- Provide a different color placard for individuals who deploy a ramp
- Have placard ID linked to DMV photo
- Implement the Los Angeles Department of Transportation practice of including the license plate number(s) of vehicles authorized for use with the placard
- Emboss the international symbol of disability on driver’s license, California I.D. or license plate

## *2E. Enforcement and Regulations*

- Develop regulations on new “retro-fitted” bikes near disabled parking lane
- Review local codes and ordinances; Federal law should trump local law
- Update building codes
- Increase enforcement (e.g., employee use of disabled parking spots, use of other people’s placards, caregivers use of placard when they are not with the placard holder, violations occurring in private parking lots)
- Increase fines for placard abuses
- Publicize program monitoring activities to deter abuses
- Enforce ADA codes with buildings built prior to the passage of the ADA that do not have adequate number of disabled parking spaces
- Decriminalize parking placard citations to speed up process of enforcement and allow for higher fines

## **3. Technology**

Participants see new and enhanced technology as a means for improving the Disability Parking Program. Specific recommendations include:

- Use technology (e.g., thumb reader, facial recognition, data in the phone) for program identification
- Provide real-time electronic access to placard holder information to better equip local parking officials to enforce laws
- Equip law enforcement with handheld devices for program parking enforcement
- Use placard as radio-frequency identification (RFID) (similar to FasTrack)
- Create an App with a payment feature
- Digitally encode placard holder’s photo into placard

# Appendix 1

## Listening Forum Agenda

### Desired Outcomes:

- Share progress by Department of Motor Vehicles on addressing audit recommendations.
- Gather feedback from diverse stakeholders on program improvements, models from other states, and proposed legislation.
- Compile and develop recommendations from forum to submit to the Legislature.

	TIME	ITEM	PRESENTER
1	1:15 – 1:25 pm	<b>Welcome, Introductions and Purpose of the Day</b>  <b>(Live Captioning)</b>	<b>Guy Leemhuis</b> CCDA Commissioner Chair  <b>Doug Wiele</b> CCDA Commissioner Vice Chair  <b>Angela Jemmott</b> CCDA Executive Director
2	1:25 – 1:30 pm	<b>Agenda Review</b> <b>(Live Captioning)</b>	<b>Eileen Jacobowitz</b> Facilitator, EJC Consulting
3	1:30 – 2:10 pm	<b>Panel on California’s Disability Parking Programs</b> <b>(Live Captioning)</b>  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Andrew Conway, DMV Chief Registration Policy and Automation</li> <li>• Matthew Eierman, Manager, City of Sacramento Parking Services</li> <li>• Christina Mills, Executive Director, California Foundation for Independent Living Centers</li> </ul>	<b>Eileen</b>
4	2:10 – 3:45 pm	<b>Small Group Discussions</b>  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Disability Parking Access</li> <li>• DMV Placard Program Management</li> <li>• Program Innovations</li> </ul>	<b>Eileen, Angela, CCDA Commissioners</b>

	<b>TIME</b>	<b>ITEM</b>	<b>PRESENTER</b>
5	3:45 – 4:00 pm	Wrap-Up, Next Steps and Closing Remarks (Live Captioning)	CCDA Commissioner, Education & Outreach Committee Chair Angela & Eileen
6	4:00 pm	Adjourn	All

**DRAFT**

## Appendix 2

### Organizations Represented at the March 13, 2018 Listening Forum

Over 50 individuals participated in the Listening Forum including public officials, disability advocates, industry groups, labor groups, Sacramento County and State of California staff, and representatives from higher education and transportation agencies. The organizations represented are listed below.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• American Automobile Association</li><li>• American Institute of Architects, California Council</li><li>• Association of California State Employees with Disabilities</li><li>• Bay Area Metro</li><li>• California Commission on Disability Access</li><li>• California Council of the Blind</li><li>• California Department of Corrections Disability Advisory Committee</li><li>• California Department of General Services, California Building Standards Commission</li><li>• California Department of Motor Vehicles</li><li>• California Department of Motor Vehicles Disability Advisory Committee</li><li>• California Department of Rehabilitation</li><li>• California Foundation for Independent Living Center</li><li>• California Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development Disability Advisory Committee</li><li>• Californians for Disability Rights, Inc.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Certified Access Specialist Program</li><li>• City of Sacramento</li><li>• City of West Sacramento</li><li>• Claremont University</li><li>• Disability Rights California</li><li>• Law Office of Melinda Wilson</li><li>• Mountain Recreation Conservation Authority</li><li>• NAIOP (Commercial Real Estate Development Association)</li><li>• Sacramento Valley Chamber of Commerce</li><li>• Sacramento Black Chamber of Commerce</li><li>• Sacramento City College</li><li>• Sacramento County Disability Compliance Office</li><li>• San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency</li><li>• Southern California Resource Services for Independent Living</li><li>• State Compensation Insurance Fund Disability Advisory Committee</li><li>• University of California, Riverside</li><li>• University of California, Los Angeles</li><li>• Valley Economic Alliance</li></ul>
---	---