

**CALIFORNIA COMMISSION ON DISABILITY ACCESS
EDUCATION AND OUTREACH COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES**

April 25, 2018

1. Call to Order

Acting Chair Chris Downey welcomed everyone and called the meeting of the Education and Outreach (E&O) Committee of the California Commission on Disability Access (CCDA) to order at approximately 10:00 a.m. at the Department of Rehabilitation, 721 Capitol Mall, Room 244, 2nd Floor, Sacramento, 95814.

The off-site meeting locations for teleconference were the City of Los Angeles Department on Disability, 201 North Figueroa Street, Suite 100, Los Angeles, 90012 and the Lighthouse for the Blind and Visually Impaired, 1155 Market Street, Room 925, San Francisco, 94103.

Acting Chair Downey reviewed the meeting protocols.

Roll Call

Staff Member St. Mary called the roll and confirmed the presence of a quorum.

Committee Members Present:

Richard Ray

Stephen Simon (Teleconference)

Committee Members Absent:

Pamela Cohen

Commissioners Present:

Chris Downey

Michael Paravagna

Commissioners Absent:

Betty Wilson, Chair

Staff Present:

Angela Jemmott, Executive Director

LaCandice Ochoa, Operations Manager

Dave Chung, Staff Services Analyst

Taylor St. Mary, Staff Services Analyst

Matthew Wang, Staff Services Analyst

Also Present:

Arnie Lerner, Lerner and Associates

Bob Planthold, San Francisco

**2. Approval of Meeting Minutes (March 29, 2017, and August 9, 2017) –
Action**

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
April 25, 2018, Meeting Minutes**

MOTION: Commissioner Paravagna moved to approve the March 29, 2017, and August 9, 2017, California Commission on Disability Access Education and Outreach Committee Meeting Minutes as presented. Committee Member Simon seconded. Motion carried unanimously with no abstentions.

3. Comments from the Public on Issues Not on this Agenda

No members of the public addressed the Committee.

4. Updating 2018 Education and Outreach Committee Meeting Calendar – Discussion and Action

LaCandice Ochoa, Operations Manager, reviewed the proposed updated 2018 E&O Committee Meeting Calendar, which was included in the meeting packet.

Commissioner Paravagna suggested Tuesday, October 23.

Committee Member Simon stated odd-numbered Tuesdays work best for him. He suggested Tuesday, July 17.

MOTION: Commissioner Paravagna moved to revise the 2018 Education and Outreach Committee Meeting Calendar meeting dates to July 17 and October 23, 2018. Committee Member Simon seconded. Motion carried unanimously with no abstentions.

a. Membership Updates

Staff Member Ochoa stated Jimmy Soto resigned from the E&O Committee. She suggested filling the vacancy with representation from the Central Valley region or other recommendations on representation for the vacancy.

Questions and Discussion

Acting Chair Downey spoke in support of appointing a representative of the Central Valley region to fill the vacancy.

Commissioner Paravagna agreed.

Committee Member Simon asked about the process to identify potential participants.

Staff Member Ochoa asked Committee Members to send recommendations to Angela Jemmott, CCDA Executive Director.

Committee Member Simon asked about the process to recruit members when no recommendations are made from Commissioners. Staff Member Ochoa stated current memberships have come from existing networks when no additional recommendations are received.

Public Comment

Ike Nnaji, Bay Area, volunteered to fill the vacancy.

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
April 25, 2018, Meeting Minutes**

Commissioner Paravagna spoke in support of Mr. Nnaji's E&O Committee membership. He suggested also recruiting membership representation from the Central Valley. He suggested that Mr. Nnaji submit material to the Executive Director and the Chair of the E&O Committee for recommended appointment.

Acting Chair Downey stated he will speak with Chair Wilson and Executive Director Jemmott about identifying additional member participation from Central California.

5. Review of March 13, 2018, Listening Forum – Discussion and Updates

a. Survey Results

Staff Member Ochoa summarized the Summary of Feedback about the Listening Forum on March 13, 2018, which was included in the meeting packet.

Executive Director Jemmott stated feedback shows an interest in lengthening the time for the Listening Forums. The Listening Forums to date have been four hours in length.

Questions and Discussion

Acting Chair Downey asked how the four hours is broken down. Executive Director Jemmott stated it is broken down into one and a half hours for panel presentations, one and a half hours for discussion, and the wrap up.

Commissioner Paravagna asked which portion of the meeting would be expanded and by how much. He stated he felt rushed in his role as a facilitator to give everyone at the table an opportunity to speak. There are individuals who are more verbal than others and it is important to hear from individuals who are less verbal. He asked if staff has received feedback on the portion of the meeting for which individuals would like more time allotted.

Executive Director Jemmott stated staff has received feedback about the desire for additional time given to interact with the experts on the panels. She suggested reducing the number of panelists, particularly for the upcoming Service Animals topic. Reducing the number of panelists will decrease the amount of time required for panel presentations, which will increase the time allotted for participants to address the panel.

Commissioner Paravagna stated another area to conserve time is to streamline the orientation information. He asked if expanding the amount of time for the forums will impact the budget. Executive Director Jemmott stated her concern that expanding the time for the forums will encroach upon the time allotted for the incubator sessions, which follow the forums.

Acting Chair Downey suggested better time management, reallocation of time within the four hours, and an efficient management of the agenda. He stated the role of the moderator is to keep things moving crisply with clear direction.

Commissioner Paravagna agreed. He suggested including direct involvement from members of the Legislature or their representatives to link them with the issues. The

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
April 25, 2018, Meeting Minutes**

upcoming topic of service animals will benefit from well-crafted legislation being introduced, and the Listening Forum may plant the seed for that movement.

b. Feedback from Staff and Commissioners

i. Integration of Technology

Executive Director Jemmott stated a team, consisting of a Commissioner and a staff member, hosted the online portion at the last Listening Forum, which was extremely successful and allowed individuals to participate who could not otherwise. She stated the need for improvement because there were some online participants who dropped off during the transition from one room to another.

Executive Director Jemmott stated a videographer was hired for the last Listening Forum but the video did not turn out as polished as hoped for because of the lighting in the room. The video is currently being edited to produce an adequate recording of the forum.

Executive Director Jemmott stated there were learning opportunities from the last Listening Forum that will improve the next one.

Questions and Discussion

Commissioner Paravagna stated a videographer is responsible for producing a deliverable product that includes appropriate imaging and sound. To do that, they need to anticipate potential lighting issues and camera setup issues and know about how the room is set up.

Executive Director Jemmott stated the need to consider additional ways to provide good technology and service to allow more individuals to participate.

ii. Attendance

Acting Chair Downey asked about the attendance at the last Listening Forum. Executive Director Jemmott stated there were approximately 50 individuals who participated over the telephone and approximately 40 individuals physically in attendance. Participants were from a diverse set of interests, such as education, business, advocates, and individuals from the community who were interested in the topic.

Acting Chair Downey asked if legislators or their staff were among the attendees. Executive Director Jemmott stated Senator Pan's office was in attendance. The Commission legislators were invited to participate but were unable to be in attendance for the Listening Forum portion of the event.

Acting Chair Downey asked about the attendance at the following later afternoon session that targeted legislators. Executive Director Jemmott stated approximately 5 to 7 individuals participated who were from legislative offices. Other legislators indicated their desire to be in attendance but were unable to.

Commissioner Paravagna suggested getting participation of legislative staff by telephone in more remote locations. He suggested hosting a coffee chat with members

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
April 25, 2018, Meeting Minutes**

of the Legislature in Sacramento after hosting Listening Forums on two to three subjects to share what has been learned about the issues to help drive the collected information home to the goal of advising the Legislature about what has been learned.

iii. Marketing Efforts

Executive Director Jemmott stated it takes many individuals who help get the word out. The Department of General Services put information on their Facebook, Twitter, Newswire, and DGS Digest. The Chambers of Commerce updated their website. She stated she hopes to double the attendance at the upcoming Listening Forum. She stated the importance of learning who the main communicator is in each region to get the word out.

Executive Director Jemmott stated staff will be posting the Listening Forum summary and the final video recording on the website shortly so stakeholders can continue to provide input on these issues.

Questions and Discussion

Commissioner Paravagna stated the need to recognize that the Commission is still in its infancy in terms of this kind of project and, as it rolls forward, a much larger contact list will be amassed. He cautioned that this will impact the size of the room and the logistics.

6. Committee Updates

a. Proposed CCDA Educational Outreach Efforts of 2018-19

i. Listening Forum – Service Animals

Commissioner Paravagna suggested following the service animals' forum with an emergency preparedness forum for individuals with disabilities.

Executive Director Jemmott stated the CCDA is not funded to do these types of efforts. Staff is looking for ways to be funded. The goal for the next three fiscal years is to receive funding from the education funding stream that the Division of the State Architect (DSA) receives from local building permits. The DSA has agreed to support the CCDA efforts.

Executive Director Jemmott reviewed the Proposed CCDA Educational Outreach Effort of 2018-19 document, which was included in the meeting packet. She stated the need for Commission approval of emergency preparedness as the next topic for the Listening Forums.

Questions and Discussion

Commissioner Paravagna suggested labeling the topic of service animals differently. There are service animals, animals in training, companion animals, therapy dogs, and differences in regulation as to how these animals are defined between the United States Department of Justice, the United States Department of Transportation, and the Air Carrier Access. He suggested a label that is broader in compass to include the entire

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
April 25, 2018, Meeting Minutes**

issue of animals in public used by persons with disabilities and get a richer mix of the issues that are out there.

Committee Member Simon agreed. He stated there is constant confusion that comes from the differences in definition. He stated he would love to see a broad discussion about how different jurisdictions are matching up those discrepancies. He stated the hope that the Listening Forums will allow the Commission to ask federal agencies to better align their definitions.

Executive Director Jemmott stated the final say is the local jurisdiction in interpreting policy when it comes to building code. She asked if the same is true for service animals.

Committee Member Simon stated the City of LA's policy is to subsume all other categories of support animals and treat them as service animals in city facilities. The city is currently rethinking that because it is difficult to implement department by department.

Commissioner Paravagna stated his hope to come to legislative solutions through the Listening Forums that could be put in place in California state law. He stated he is glad Committee Member Simon is stepping forward and trying to do something. Committee Member Simon's participation in the forum and looking at the issues that have evolved as it moves forward will be critical to the success of the next Listening Forum.

Committee Member Simon asked staff to let him know when it is appropriate to come back to the emergency preparedness topic and when that Listening Forum will be in Southern California. He stated he strongly supports this because his organization has looked at this thoroughly and it is a great opportunity for a focused look at the impact of the potential best practices for Title III entities. He offered to host a Los Angeles Listening Forum in the Los Angeles Emergency Operations Center (EOC).

MOTION: Commissioner Paravagna moved to adopt the topic of emergency management in its broadest sense as the topic addressed after service animals and that that concept is taken to the full Commission for approval. Committee Member Simon seconded. Motion carried unanimously with no abstentions.

7. Internal E&O Projects – Discussion and Updates

a. DGS Website Redesign and Modernization Project Overview

b. Website Accessibility

Executive Director Jemmott reviewed the DGS Website Redesign and Modernization Project Summary, which was included in the meeting packet. She asked if there are customer features that should be incorporated into the website and ways to ensure the website is fully accessible.

Questions and Discussion

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
April 25, 2018, Meeting Minutes**

Commissioner Paravagna stated the standard accepted by the federal government is the Web Content Accessibility Guidelines (WCAG 2.0). The DGS, as host of the website, is responsible for compliance of the guidelines.

Committee Member Simon suggested that someone ask them and not just assume. He stated his organization has contracted with an outside entity to run software. He asked who verifies with DGS whether it is compliant. Executive Director Jemmott stated the CCDA should already have an accessible website. The reality is the Home Page is accessible but the other pages behind it falter due to the lack of tools or training to manage it. This is a good time to take a strong look at the practices and principles of how each program operates.

Commissioner Paravagna stated the need to clarify the roles in terms of who is responsible for ensuring that the standards are met. He suggested that staff meet with the Lighthouse for the Blind to discuss ways to attack this. DGS is also looking for advice on how to approach this.

Acting Chair Downey asked about the last time the website was evaluated and if there have been any complaints about the accessibility of the website. Executive Director Jemmott stated there have been no complaints and the CCDA website has never been evaluated. The goal is to have a member of staff appointed to do this work full-time.

Acting Chair Downey agreed with working with the Lighthouse for the Blind and perhaps other resources to develop recommendations for best practices. He stated, along with staff training, there should be training within technology changes. Even if staff have gone through the training, they will require ongoing training to stay current with technology and situations out there.

Committee Member Ray stated the website has some areas that could be improved. He stated he used the human check on the website and also has several tools that can be used to do that check.

Acting Chair Downey suggested sharing best practices and resources as they are discovered during this process. Web accessibility is a critical issue for accessibility for commerce today for goods and services.

Public Comment

Arnie Lerner, Lerner and Associates, agreed. He stated he advises clients who have alternative ways of providing access to put it on their website, and yet there is nowhere to find out if their websites are accessible.

8. Future Agenda Items

No future agenda items were offered.

9. Adjourn

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at approximately 11:30 a.m.